

# **EXHIBIT E**

N. LaLota  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----x  
ANA FLORES, RENE FLORES, MARIA MAGDALENA HERNANDEZ, MAGALI  
ROMAN, MAKE THE ROAD NEW YORK, and NEW YORK COMMUNITIES  
FOR CHANGE,

Plaintiffs, Case No.  
18-CV-3549 (E.D.N.Y.)

vs.

TOWN OF ISLIP, ISLIP TOWN BOARD, and SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD  
OF ELECTIONS,

Defendants.  
-----x

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF  
NICHOLAS LALOTA  
Hempstead, New York  
February 21, 2019

Reported by:  
THOMAS A. FERNICOLA, RPR  
JOB NO. 156227

1 N. LaLota

2  
3  
4  
5 February 21, 2019

6 9:30 a.m.  
7  
8

9 VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION of NICHOLAS LALOTA, held  
10 at The Law Offices of Law Offices of Frederick K.  
11 Brewington, 556 Peninsula Boulevard, Hempstead, New  
12 York, before Thomas A. Fernicola, a Registered  
13 Professional Reporter and Notary Public of the State of  
14 New York.  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 N. LaLota

2 A P P E A R A N C E S:

3  
4 PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON  
5 Attorneys for the Plaintiff(s)

6 1285 Avenue of the Americas

7 New York, New York 10019

8 BY: MICHAEL PERNICK, ESQ.

9 ALEXANDER ATKINS, ESQ.

10  
11  
12 LAW OFFICES OF FREDERICK K. BREWINGTON  
13 Attorneys for the Plaintiff(s)

14 556 Peninsula Blvd

15 Hempstead, New York 11550

16 BY: TRICIA LINDSAY, ESQ.

1 N. LaLota

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (Cont'd):

3  
4 Sinnreich Kosakoff & Messina  
5 Attorneys for the Town of Islip

6 267 Carleton Avenue

7 Central Islip, New York 11722

8 BY: VINCENT MESSINA, ESQ.

9  
10  
11 SUFFOLK COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF LAW  
12 Attorneys for the Suffolk County Board of  
13 Elections

14 H. Lee Dennison Building

15 100 Veterans Memorial Highway

16  
17 Hauppauge, New York 11788

18 BY: DANIEL FURSHPAN, ESQ.

1 N. LaLota

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (Cont'd):

3  
4  
5 STEVEN LOSQUADRO, ESQ.

6 Attorneys for the Witness

7 649 Route 25A

8 Rocky Point, New York 11778

9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15 ALSO PRESENT:

16 KEVIN MARTH, Videographer.

1 N. LaLota

2 sorts of projects; that if that area had a  
3 councilmanic district where one council member  
4 was accountable to that local area, those  
5 voices would be less likely to be drowned out.

6 Q Do you believe that the at-large  
7 structure limits access to the candidate's  
8 slating process for political parties?

9 A Could you reframe the question?

10 Q Sure.

11 Is it difficult for individuals who  
12 are not connected to the political party to  
13 secure the nomination for a seat in the Town  
14 of Babylon?

15 A I could tell you from my experience  
16 as Commission of the Board of Elections that a  
17 council district would have a smaller  
18 signature requirement to get one's name onto a  
19 ballot.

20 I think it's been estimated that if  
21 there were council districts in Babylon, there  
22 would be a 500-signature requirement to get  
23 one's name onto the ballot, but at an at-large  
24 system, there's 1,250 signatures or so.

25 I may be a couple hundred off on

1 N. LaLota

2 that, but the number required is much greater,  
3 which dissuades a lot of local voices from  
4 getting involved.

5 Q A moment ago you talked about how a  
6 ward-based system increases accountability and  
7 can allow elected officials to provide better  
8 services; is that right?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Are there any other reasons why  
11 those public-policy observations apply  
12 exclusively to Babylon and would not also  
13 apply to other towns with at-large structures  
14 like the Town of Islip?

15 A I think it's fair to say that one's  
16 knowledge of the stoplights, traffic lights  
17 and potholes relative to where they live, that  
18 that approach is right in Babylon and it could  
19 be right in other towns as well.

20 Q And Babylon and Islip, in terms of  
21 population, are they roughly the same size?

22 A I understand Islip to have a larger  
23 population, maybe 20 percent more.

24 Q Have you been quoted in news  
25 articles regarding your support for districts



1 N. LaLota

2 quoting as saying:

3 "It's just simply not transparent.  
4 Neither the public nor the press really has  
5 the opportunity to understand how taxpayer  
6 money is being spent."

7 Do you see that, sir?

8 A I do.

9 Q Did you say that?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Do you believe there's a  
12 relationship between the lack of a  
13 transparency and the at-large structure?

14 A Yes. I think it takes a couple  
15 steps to get there, though. I think that this  
16 really just reiterates what I said earlier.

17 In Babylon, there's an at-large  
18 system controlled by a supervisor who is  
19 concurrently the political party chairman.  
20 Because of that, there's a tendency for that  
21 chairman to put folks on the Town Board who  
22 won't question his initiatives.

23 So in Babylon, that dynamic leads to  
24 a lack of transparency, a lack of dialogue,  
25 which is not productive to the taxpayers, in

1 N. LaLota

2 my opinion.

3 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 4, Document  
4 Flores 2663, was marked for  
5 identification.)

6 BY MR. PERNICK:

7 Q You've been handed Plaintiff's  
8 Exhibit 4, which is marked Flores 2663.

9 Can you identify this as an email  
10 that you sent to Chairman@SuffolkCountyGOP.com  
11 on July 2, 2018, with the Subject: "Council  
12 District Palm Card"?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Whose email address is  
15 Chairman@SuffolkCountyGOP.com?

16 A The chairman, John Jay LaValle.

17 Q What is his role?

18 A He is a Chairman of the Suffolk  
19 County Republican Committee.

20 Q In this email, were you providing  
21 language to be used on Palm cards?

22 A Yes.

23 Q These were Palm cards for your  
24 efforts to secure council districts in  
25 Babylon, correct?

1 N. LaLota

2 A They were intended to be Palm cards.  
3 My understanding is the Palm cards never got  
4 printed.

5 Q Did you write this language?

6 A Yes.

7 Q In the section of your email  
8 regarding Slide 1, you write:

9 "Candidates for Town Council aren't  
10 really democratically-elected. Rather,  
11 candidates are hand picked by one man."

12 Do you see that?

13 A Yes.

14 Q In Babylon, would this mean that  
15 people who are not connected to the Democrat  
16 party establishment would have difficulty  
17 getting on the slate?

18 A Yes.

19 May I ask clarify that? You say  
20 "slate." I answered the question if it meant  
21 ballot. I'm not sure what you meant by  
22 "slate."

23 Q "Ballot's" fine.

24 What do you understand the word  
25 "slate" to mean?

1 N. LaLota

2 A A slate is typically a group of  
3 candidates a party would endorse to either  
4 compete in the primary and/or general  
5 election.

6 Q Does the at-large structure make it  
7 more difficult for a candidate to get on the  
8 slate?

9 A Would you repeat the question?

10 Q Does the at-large structure make it  
11 more difficult for a candidate to get on the  
12 party's slate?

13 A It depends who the candidate is.

14 Q In Babylon, is it more difficult for  
15 certain candidates to get on the slate because  
16 of the at-large structure?

17 MR. MESSINA: I'm going to object.  
18 What slate are we talking about? There's  
19 different slates.

20 MR. PERNICK: Sure, I'll clarify.

21 Q Is it difficult to get on the Town  
22 Democratic slate in the Town of Babylon  
23 because of the at-large structure?

24 A I don't think I can answer that  
25 "yes" or "no." I can answer it in a different

1 N. LaLota

2 way, if you'd like.

3 Q Go ahead.

4 A My understanding of how the Democrat  
5 party candidates are selected in the Town of  
6 Babylon is the Democrat party chairman Rich  
7 Schaffer nominates the individual, and that  
8 individual winds up on the ballot  
9 subsequently.

10 It's not organic. It's not like a  
11 civic association president or a school board  
12 member or somebody in between approaches the  
13 committee and says "I want to be the  
14 candidate," and they say yes. It's much more  
15 top-down, from my understanding.

16 Q So individuals who are not connected  
17 to the Democrat party establishment, is it  
18 more difficult for them to get on the slate?

19 A Yes.

20 Q On this email, do you see towards  
21 the bottom of the section regarding Slide 1,  
22 the paragraph that starts with "red tape," you  
23 write:

24 "When constituents of one hamlet  
25 have a problem with taxes, trash pickup,

1 N. LaLota

2 potholes, street lights or a zoning issue,  
3 they do not have a single council member to  
4 hold accountable."

5 A I see that.

6 Q Do you agree that at-large districts  
7 make it more difficult to hold council members  
8 accountable?

9 A Yes.

10 Q Further down under Slide 2, you  
11 write:

12 "Each council district will likely  
13 be comprised of two to three hamlets each,  
14 with each council member elected from within  
15 the community who best understands their  
16 needs."

17 Do you see that?

18 A I do see it.

19 Q Do you agree that council districts  
20 allow voters to elect candidates from their  
21 community who better understand their needs?

22 A Yes.

23 Q In the next paragraph, you write:

24 "If the council member responds well  
25 to his or her district's needs, they'll likely

1 N. LaLota

2 earn re-election. If not, the new  
3 smaller-sized districts will give voters a  
4 real ability to select a new representative."

5 Do you see that?

6 A I see it.

7 Q And you agree that council districts  
8 make it easier for voters to elect  
9 representatives who are more responsive and to  
10 vote out representatives who are not  
11 responsive?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Do any of these public policy  
14 arguments apply exclusively to Babylon or  
15 would they apply equally to Babylon and Islip?

16 A Though I think politics has a  
17 tendency to make each individual situation  
18 different, I think the general proposition of  
19 smaller districts making elected officials  
20 more accountable is adaptable to a number of  
21 towns.

22 Q Including Islip?

23 A Yes.

24 Q At the bottom of the page, you  
25 wrote:

1 N. LaLota

2 A I do.

3 Q Please turn to the attachment. What  
4 do you recognize this to be?

5 Withdrawn.

6 Do you recognize this document?

7 A I do.

8 Q What do you recognize this to be?

9 A A petition for council districts for  
10 the Town of Babylon.

11 Q Can you identify this as the  
12 petition that was used to collect signatures  
13 in order to get the ward system proposition on  
14 the ballot in 2016?

15 A With some confidence, I can. There  
16 were a number of petitions. One of them was  
17 flawed in structure and it was revised  
18 subsequently. I don't know if this was the  
19 revised one or if this was the one used in  
20 2016 or not.

21 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 9, Document  
22 Flores 2740, was marked for  
23 identification.)

24 BY MR. PERNICK:

25 Q You were handed Plaintiff's



1 N. LaLota

2 Exhibit 9, which is marked Flores 2740? Do  
3 you recognize this document?

4 A I do.

5 Q Can you tell us what this document  
6 is?

7 A It's the petition used in 2016.

8 Q Is this the same petition that we  
9 were just looking at in the previous exhibit?

10 A Yes.

11 Q But in Exhibit 9, the petition has  
12 been filled in the signatures; is that  
13 correct?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Who is allowed to sign the petition?

16 A Anybody who is registered to vote in  
17 the Town of Babylon.

18 Q Who is allowed to collect signatures  
19 and serve as a witness to those signatures?

20 A I believe any registered voter in  
21 the State of New York.

22 Q Please turn to the page that is  
23 stamped on the bottom 2894.

24 A I'm there.

25 Q Do you recognize this as the same

1 N. LaLota

2 2016 petition?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Who was the witness to these  
5 petition signatures?

6 A Dimitrios Lagias.

7 Q Do you know who that is?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Who is that?

10 A He goes by Jimmy Lagias, and he  
11 works with me at the Board of Elections.

12 Q What town did Mr. Lagias live in at  
13 the time he was witness to these signatures?

14 A I don't know where he lives.

15 Q Do you see he wrote his address as I  
16 believe it's 137 Woodland Avenue, Great River,  
17 New York 17722?

18 A I do see that.

19 Q Do you have any reason to believe  
20 that address is incorrect?

21 A Yes. I understand that he has lived  
22 a number of places. I neither know that's  
23 where he lives or doesn't live.

24 Q Do you see at the bottom he wrote  
25 "Islip" with his signature?

1 N. LaLota

2 A Yes.

3 Q Do you have any reason to believe he  
4 did not live in the Town of Islip at the time?

5 A Like I said, I understand he has  
6 moved a couple of times recently. I can't  
7 confirm where Jimmy Lagias lives or doesn't  
8 live. I'm not trying to be evasive.

9 Q At the time of the petition, do you  
10 have any reason to believe that did he not  
11 live in Islip?

12 A Same answer.

13 Q Do you know that he lived in Islip  
14 at some point in time?

15 A I don't know.

16 Q Do you think he's lying on the  
17 petition?

18 MR. LOSQUADRO: Same objection as  
19 presented earlier.

20 A Do I have a reason to believe he's  
21 lying?

22 Q Correct.

23 A No.

24 Q Could you turn to 2911?

25 A Okay.

1 N. LaLota

2 Q Do you recognize this as the same  
3 petition?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Who is the witness to these petition  
6 signatures?

7 A Arthur Laufer.

8 Q Do you know who that is?

9 A I do.

10 Q Who is he?

11 A He's an employee of the Board of  
12 Elections and a West Islip resident.

13 Q And West Islip is within the Town of  
14 Islip?

15 A It is.

16 Q I'm going to introduce another  
17 exhibit. Please leave this out for a moment.

18 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 10, Document,  
19 was marked for identification.)

20 BY MR. PERNICK:

21 Q You were you handed Exhibit 10. Do  
22 you recognize this document?

23 A I do.

24 Q What do you recognize this document  
25 to be?

1 N. LaLota

2 A A list of Town of Islip Republican  
3 Committeemen elected in 2017.

4 Q I'll represent for the record this  
5 document was provided to us by the Board of  
6 Elections this morning.

7 Is there any reason why this  
8 document would be inaccurate?

9 A No.

10 Q What is the purpose of the Town of  
11 Islip Republican Committee?

12 A To support candidates for public  
13 office who share in the Republican party  
14 principles.

15 Q Do members of the committee have any  
16 official authority?

17 A Yes.

18 Q What is that authority?

19 A At conventions, they have a  
20 statutory authority to support candidates who  
21 can have the Republican party's designation.

22 Q What do you mean by "support"?

23 A I mean that in those designation  
24 conventions, that slates of candidates are  
25 presented. And in order for those slates to

1 N. LaLota

2 be adopted by the committee, committeemen and  
3 women have to vote for those individuals.

4 Q Do members of the committee play a  
5 role in selecting party leadership?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Do members of the committee play a  
8 role in selecting candidates?

9 A Yes.

10 Q If you go to page 9, you see under  
11 ED208 the name Arthur Laufer?

12 A I see that.

13 Q Do you believe that's the same  
14 Arthur Laufer who witnessed the petition page  
15 we were just looking at?

16 A Yes.

17 MR. MESSINA: Did you say 209?

18 MR. PERNICK: 209.

19 MR. MESSINA: Do you want to take  
20 another look?

21 MR. PERNICK: I apologize, 208.

22 THE WITNESS: We see Counsel  
23 Messina's name on page 8.

24 BY MR. PERNICK:

25 Q In Exhibit 9, could you turn to the

1 N. LaLota

2 page that is Bates stamped Flores 2920?

3 A I'm there.

4 Q Do you recognize as the same 2016  
5 petition?

6 A I do.

7 Q Who was the witness to these  
8 petition signatures?

9 A I don't recognize nor can I really  
10 make out the name. John N...

11 Q I believe it's John L-u-q-u-e-r,  
12 III. Do you know who that is?

13 A I do not.

14 Q What town did Mr. Luquer live in at  
15 the time he was witness to these signatures?

16 A This petition says that he lived in  
17 West Islip.

18 Q Please turn back to the committee  
19 list, Exhibit 10. On page 3 next to ED58, do  
20 you see the second name, it says John N.  
21 Luquer, III?

22 A I do.

23 Q Do you believe this to be the same  
24 John N. Luquer, III, who witnessed the  
25 signature page that you're looking at?

1 N. LaLota

2 MR. MESSINA: Objection to form. He  
3 already answered that he didn't know who  
4 John N. Luquer, III was so how can he know  
5 if it's the same one when he doesn't know  
6 the first one?

7 Q Do you have any reason to believe  
8 that John N. Luquer, at 62 Sutton Court, West  
9 Islip, New York 11795 on the committee list is  
10 a different John Luquer than the John N.  
11 Luquer, III, who lives at 62 Sutton Court,  
12 West Islip, New York, on the petition?

13 A No.

14 Q Please turn back to the page Bates  
15 stamped Flores 2745. Do you recognize this to  
16 be the same 2016 petition?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Who was the witness to these  
19 petition signatures?

20 A Edward Wiggins.

21 Q Do you know who that is?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Could you explain who that is?

24 A He is an executive committee member  
25 of the Babylon Town Republican Committee.



1 N. LaLota

2 Q Do you know what town he lived in at  
3 the time he signed these petitions?

4 A I do not.

5 Q Do you see where it says  
6 Lindenhurst, New York beneath his signature?

7 A Yes.

8 Q This is dated 8/30/2016. Do you see  
9 that?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Do you know where Mr. Wiggins lives  
12 today?

13 A I believe he lives in West Islip, in  
14 the Town of Islip.

15 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 11, Document  
16 Flores 3800, was marked for  
17 identification.)

18 BY MR. PERNICK:

19 Q We're done with Exhibit 9, but you  
20 should keep Exhibit 10 out. We're going to  
21 come back to that.

22 You were handed Plaintiff's  
23 Exhibit 11, which is marked Flores 3800. Can  
24 you identify this as an email that you sent to  
25 numerous "bcc" recipients on September 1,

1 N. LaLota

2 call one person on those "potholes, stopsign,  
3 street light" sort of issues.

4 That when an individual who was  
5 knocking on the door was trying to sell this  
6 concept, and we saw many emails that  
7 articulated what the concept was, that once  
8 the voter understood what it was, they were  
9 generally supportive of it.

10 Q When you were going door to door,  
11 did you talk only to Republicans?

12 A No. The effort was broad-based. It  
13 wasn't partisan. It wasn't targeted based  
14 upon any party or no party.

15 Q Is it your impression that both  
16 Democrats, Republicans and Independents gave  
17 you this positive feedback at the door?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Let's look at some more petitions.

20 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 14, Document  
21 Flores 3301, was marked for  
22 identification.)

23 BY MR. PERNICK:

24 Q You were handed Plaintiff's  
25 Exhibit 14, which is marked Flores 3301. Do

1 N. LaLota

2 you recognize this document?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Can you tell me what this document  
5 is?

6 A It's a ward system petition.

7 Q Is this the petition that you used  
8 in 2017?

9 A I see a couple of 2018 dates so it  
10 may have been 2017 and 2018.

11 Q This is how the document was  
12 produced to us. Do you have any reason to  
13 believe that these are not accurate copies of  
14 the petitions?

15 A I have no reason to believe they are  
16 inaccurate.

17 Q Could you turn to the page that is  
18 stamped 3311, please.

19 MR. MESSINA: Counsel, just to  
20 clarify, you said these are the documents  
21 produced to you. By whom?

22 MR. PERNICK: By Mark Gallo.

23 A I'm at 3311.

24 Q Do you recognize this document?

25 A I do.

1 N. LaLota

2 Q Is this the same 2017 petition that  
3 we were looking at in the previous exhibit?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Who was the witness to these  
6 petitions?

7 A Judy Lambiase.

8 Q Do you know who that is?

9 A I do.

10 Q Who is she?

11 A She works with me at the Board of  
12 Elections.

13 Q What town did Ms. Lambiase live in  
14 at the time she was witness to these  
15 petitions?

16 A Bay Shore, the Town of Islip.

17 Q If you go back to Exhibit 10, and  
18 you go to ED34, the second name is Judith E.  
19 Lambiase. Do you see that?

20 A I do.

21 Q Is that the same Judy Lambiase who  
22 witnessed these petitions?

23 A Being that I used to be her paperboy  
24 back in the day, yes, I know that she lives at  
25 this address.

1 N. LaLota

2 Q So that's a yes?

3 A It is.

4 MR. MESSINA: I'll stipulate to  
5 that. She used to work for me at one time  
6 too.

7 MR. PERNICK: It's a small world.

8 Q Can you turn to the page Bates  
9 stamped 3366?

10 A I'm at 3366.

11 Q Who was the witness to these  
12 petition signatures?

13 A Edward Wiggins.

14 Q Do you see the address he signed as  
15 27 Crag Court, West Islip?

16 A I do.

17 Q West Islip is in the Town of Islip,  
18 correct?

19 A It is.

20 Q It appears that Mr. Wiggins moved  
21 from Lindenhurst to West Islip at some time  
22 between the previous petition that we looked  
23 at, and this one which appears to be dated  
24 7/7/2018 based on the context; is that right?

25 A That it appears that way, yes.

1 N. LaLota

2 Q Do you know if Mr. Wiggins is  
3 involved in Islip politics?

4 A I don't know what his involvement  
5 is, if any, in Islip politics.

6 Q Even though he moved to Islip, he  
7 came back to support the Babylon referendum  
8 effort?

9 A My understanding is he never  
10 discontinue his support of Babylon Republican  
11 politics.

12 Q Can you turn to 3380?

13 A I'm at 3380.

14 Q Who is the witness to these  
15 patients?

16 A Dimitrios Lagias.

17 Q It's the same Dimitrios Lagias who  
18 we observed in the 2016 effort?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Again, he wrote his address as Great  
21 River in the Town of Islip?

22 A He did.

23 Q Let's move on.

24

25

1 N. LaLota

2 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 15, Document  
3 Flores 3065, was marked for  
4 identification.)

5 BY MR. PERNICK:

6 Q You were handed Exhibit 15 which is  
7 Flores 3065. Do you recognize this document?

8 A I do.

9 Q If you flip through it, is this the  
10 same 2017 petition that we were looking at  
11 previously?

12 A It appears so.

13 Q Please turn to the page stamped  
14 3067.

15 A Okay.

16 Q Who is the witness to these  
17 signatures?

18 A John N. Luquer, III.

19 Q Just to be clear, you don't know who  
20 that is?

21 A I do not.

22 Q But it says here he lives in West  
23 Islip?

24 A It does.

25 Q His name appears in the committee

1 N. LaLota

2 person list that we were looking at?

3 A Yes. There is a John N. Luquer, III  
4 in the committee list.

5 Q Please turn to 3069. Who is the  
6 witness to these petition signatures?

7 A Ralph A. Appea.

8 Q Do you know who that is?

9 A I do.

10 Q Who is he?

11 A I know him to be a Babylon  
12 Republican who works at the Suffolk OTB.

13 Q Do you know what town Mr. Appea  
14 lived in at the time that he was witness to  
15 these signatures?

16 A I don't know.

17 Q Do you see here he wrote his address  
18 as 30 West Shope [sic] Road, Oakdale, New  
19 York?

20 A I think it's "Shore," but yes.

21 Q West Shore Road, Oakdale, New York.  
22 Oakdale is a hamlet of Islip?

23 A It is.

24 Q Do you have any reason to believe  
25 that this address is incorrect?



1 N. LaLota

2 A No.

3 Q Did you ever know Mr. Appea to live  
4 in Islip?

5 A No. I don't know where he lived or  
6 where he lives.

7 Q Please turn to the next page, 3071.

8 A Okay.

9 Q This is the same 2017 petition,  
10 right?

11 A The signatures were collected in  
12 2017, yes.

13 Q Who is the witness to this petition?

14 A Ryan S. -- I can't make out the last  
15 name.

16 Q Skelly? Do you know who that is?

17 A I do not.

18 Q What town did Mr. Skelly list as his  
19 address on this petition?

20 A The hamlet he indicates he lives in  
21 is Brentwood.

22 Q Brentwood is a hamlet of Islip,  
23 correct?

24 A It is.

25 Q Let's turn to 3073. This is the

1 N. LaLota

2 same 2017 petition?

3 A It is.

4 Q Who is the witness to this petition?

5 A Robert Moro is the witness who  
6 indicates he lives in Sayville in the Town of  
7 Islip.

8 Q Do you know who Mr. Moro is?

9 A I do not.

10 Q Can you turn back to the committee  
11 person list, Exhibit 10?

12 A Okay.

13 Q On page 5 under ED106, do you see  
14 Robert Moro's name there?

15 A I do.

16 Q Does the address on the committee  
17 person list match the address on the petition  
18 signature?

19 A No. It doesn't have Apartment K-4  
20 on the petition.

21 Q The address on the committee person  
22 list says 218 Lakeland Avenue, Apartment K-4,  
23 Sayville, New York 11782, correct?

24 A Yes.

25 Q The address on the petition is 218

1 N. LaLota

2 Lakeland Avenue, Sayville?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Do you have any reason to believe  
5 that this is not the same person?

6 A I do not.

7 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 16, Document  
8 Flores 3128, was marked for  
9 identification.)

10 BY MR. PERNICK:

11 Q You were handed Plaintiff's  
12 Exhibit 16, which is marked Flores 3128. Do  
13 you recognize this document?

14 A I do.

15 Q Was this document?

16 A It looks like the council district  
17 petition for Babylon that was collected in  
18 both 2017 and 2018.

19 Q This is the same petition that we've  
20 been looking at?

21 A I believe so, yes.

22 Q Can you turn to 3142, please?

23 A I'm there.

24 Q This is the same petition?

25 A It is.

1 N. LaLota

2 Q Who was the witness to this  
3 petition?

4 A Annamaria Curella.

5 Q Do you know who that is?

6 A I do.

7 Q Who is it?

8 A She works for the County Clerk's  
9 Office, I believe.

10 Q What town did Ms. Curella live in at  
11 the time she was witness to these signatures?

12 A She says she's at 27 Crag Court in  
13 West Islip.

14 Q And West Islip is a hamlet of Islip?

15 A It is.

16 Q Can you turn to 3166?

17 A Okay.

18 Q Do you recognize this as the same  
19 2017 petition?

20 A I do.

21 Q Who was the witness to this  
22 petition?

23 A Artie Faufer.

24 Q And the same Artie Laufer who we saw  
25 in the previous petition and the committee

1 N. LaLota

2 person list?

3 A Yes, sir.

4 Q He lives in West Islip in the Town  
5 of Islip?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Please turn to 3199. Do you  
8 recognize this as the same 2017 petition?

9 A I do.

10 Q Who is the witness to these petition  
11 signatures?

12 A Neil Rosenberg.

13 Q Do you know who Neil Rosenberg is?

14 A I do.

15 Q Who is he?

16 A He is an employee at the Suffolk  
17 County Board of Elections.

18 Q What hamlet did Mr. Rosenberg live  
19 in at the time he was a witness to these  
20 signatures?

21 A He says Ronkonkoma.

22 Q Ronkonkoma is a hamlet of Islip,  
23 correct?

24 A It is.

25 Q Do you have any reason to believe he

1 N. LaLota

2 does not live in Islip?

3 A I have no reason to not believe  
4 that.

5 Q If you go back to Exhibit 10 and go  
6 to page 2, ED25, do you see Neil Rosenberg's  
7 name there?

8 A I do.

9 Q Does the address 2188 Pine Avenue,  
10 Ronkonkoma, New York, on the committee person  
11 list match the address on the petition?

12 A It does.

13 MR. MESSINA: Counsel, in the  
14 interest of brevity, you seem to have a  
15 few of these. Why don't we compile a  
16 list? We can stipulate as to whether or  
17 not they're on both documents and what  
18 addresses they put on those documents.

19 The witness has no individual  
20 knowledge of anything. In fact, doesn't  
21 know many of these people.

22 MR. PERNICK: We're almost done.

23 We are done.

24 BY MR. PERNICK:

25 Q So we've just identified a number of

1 N. LaLota

2 9700.

3 Q What's the population roughly of the  
4 Town of Babylon?

5 A I don't know offhand. I would guess  
6 225,000 or so.

7 Q What's the population of the Town of  
8 Islip with respect to the population of  
9 Babylon?

10 A I think it's 20 or 30 percent  
11 bigger.

12 Q Mr. Messina asked you about your  
13 position, that there's a lower bar to  
14 candidates running when there are districts.  
15 And you explained this was due to the reduced  
16 petitioning requirement; is that right?

17 A Would you rephrase the question?

18 Q Mr. Messina asked you about your  
19 position, that there's a lower bar to  
20 candidates running. Do you remember that?

21 A In council districts by definition  
22 there would be less signatures required. So  
23 if that's the bar you're referring to, the  
24 answer is yes.

25 Q Is it also the case that smart

1 N. LaLota

2 MR. FURSHPAN: I think if at in time  
3 you feel uncomfortable and wish that  
4 Mr. Losquadro be here, you'll let us know  
5 and we'll just come back another time.

6 THE WITNESS: I'm okay with that.

7 BY MR. PERNICK:

8 Q The Board of Elections has  
9 experienced administering special elections,  
10 correct?

11 A Yes.

12 Q During your time at the Board of  
13 Elections, how many times has the BOE  
14 administered a special election?

15 A In my five years, maybe five or ten.

16 Q Do you know if the Board of  
17 Elections has administered special elections  
18 prior to that?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Do you know how many in the last,  
21 let's say, 20 years?

22 A If I had to guess, we'd average one  
23 or two special elections per year.

24 Q And is the Board of Elections  
25 currently administering a special election?



1 N. LaLota

2 Federal -- are connected by the County Board  
3 of Elections in a bipartisan manner, and its  
4 processes are implemented by both  
5 commissioners in a bipartisan basis.

6 That situation doesn't exist when we  
7 are acting as a vendor or an advisee to school  
8 board elections or library district elections  
9 or fire district elections where the clerk  
10 maintains that authority.

11 Q So for the purpose of the rest of my  
12 questions today when I refer to an election,  
13 I'll be referring to the set of elections that  
14 you have authority over unless I say  
15 otherwise. Do you understand?

16 A Okay.

17 Q Is it fair to say the Board of  
18 Elections has experienced administering or  
19 exercising its authority over elections that  
20 have districts at multiple levels of  
21 government?

22 A It is fair.

23 Q Are you familiar with the objective  
24 of our lawsuit?

25 A I think so.

1 N. LaLota

2 noted on the record, but please refrain  
3 from speaking objections.

4 BY MR. PERNICK:

5 Q Are you aware of any technical  
6 reasons why it would be impossible to blackout  
7 a particular election using a marker or other  
8 device?

9 A No.

10 Q So it would be possible?

11 MR. FURSHPAN: Objection.

12 A It would be possible.

13 Q If the court were to cancel the  
14 Islip Town Board election one week before the  
15 primary, and there were other elections on the  
16 ballot at that time, it would be possible to  
17 administer that; is that correct?

18 A What is the "that" in that sentence?

19 Q The election, the remaining  
20 elections.

21 A Yes, with the caveat being the voter  
22 confusion issue. That if there's an office up  
23 for election on the ballot where the votes  
24 won't actually be counted, that's not in the  
25 spirit of how the Suffolk County Board of

1 N. LaLota

2 Elections or probably any Board of Elections  
3 throughout the State of New York conducts  
4 their elections.

5 We go out of our way to reduce voter  
6 confusion, and having offices on the ballot  
7 where the votes won't actually be counted is  
8 definitely in the realm of confusing voters.

9 Q Understood.

10 So aside from voter-confusion  
11 issues, are there other reasons why the Board  
12 of Elections would have issues with  
13 implementing an election -- excuse me --  
14 implementing a court order canceling the Islip  
15 primary if the court order were issued one  
16 week before the election?

17 A I can't think of any as I sit here  
18 right now.

19 MR. FURSHPAN: I'm going to object  
20 to that question. It was previously asked  
21 and answered.

22 Q Now, let's turn to the other  
23 scenario where the Islip primary is the only  
24 primary on the ballot and the court cancels  
25 the primary four weeks prior to the election.

1 N. LaLota

2  
3 C E R T I F I C A T E  
4

5 STATE OF NEW YORK )  
6 ) ss.:  
7 COUNTY OF NEW YORK )  
8

9 I, THOMAS A. FERNICOLA, Registered  
10 Reporter and Notary Public within and for  
11 the State of New York, do hereby certify  
12 that the within is a true and accurate  
13 transcript of the proceedings held on  
14 February 21, 2019.

15 That I am not related to any of the  
16 parties to this action by blood or  
17 marriage; and that I am in no way  
18 interested in the outcome of this matter.

19 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto  
20 set my hand this 22nd day of February  
21 2019.

22 

23 \_\_\_\_\_  
24 THOMAS A. FERNICOLA, RPR  
25

N. LaLota

----- INDEX -----

ATTORNEY	PAGE
Mr. Pernick	7
Mr. Messina	121
Mr. Pernick	149
Mr. Messina	156
Mr. Messina	243
Mr. Furshpan	257

N. LaLota

----- EXHIBITS -----

PLAINTIFF'S

DESCRIPTION	PAGE	LINE
Exhibit 1 Newsday article dated August 31, 2016,	20	4
Exhibit 2 Email Flores 3786,	27	5
Exhibit 3 Newsday article from January 16, 2018,	30	18
Exhibit 4 Document Flores 2663,	34	3
Exhibit 5 Document Flores 3783,	42	4
Exhibit 6 Document Flores 3102,	45	15
Exhibit 7 Document,	50	16
Exhibit 8 Document Flores 3759,	62	3
Exhibit 9 Document Flores 2740,	63	21
Exhibit 10 Document,	67	18
Exhibit 11 Document Flores 3800,	72	15
Exhibit 12 Document Flores 3802,	73	25
Exhibit 13 Document Flores 3825,	76	10
Exhibit 14 Document Flores 3301,	78	20
Exhibit 15 Document Flores 3065,	82	24
Exhibit 16 Document Flores 3128,	87	7
Exhibit 17 Document Flores 4088,	92	22
Exhibit 18 Document Flores 2649,	98	8
Exhibit 19 Document Flores 4074,	104	2

N. LaLota

----- EXHIBITS (Cont'd) -----

PLAINTIFF'S

DESCRIPTION	PAGE	LINE
Exhibit 20 Document Flores 3813,	109	16
Exhibit 21 Document Flores 3798,	110	12
Exhibit 22 Document Flores 3912,	115	15
Exhibit 23 Document Flores 4067,	118	2
Exhibit 24 Document,	160	8
Exhibit 25 Document,	203	21
Exhibit 26 Document,	231	24

## ERRATA SHEET

Case Name:

Deposition Date:

Deponent:

Pg.	No.	Now Reads	Should Read	Reason
6	---	-----	-----	-----
7	---	-----	-----	-----
8	---	-----	-----	-----
9	---	-----	-----	-----
10	---	-----	-----	-----
11	---	-----	-----	-----
12	---	-----	-----	-----
13	---	-----	-----	-----
14	---	-----	-----	-----
15	---	-----	-----	-----
16	---	-----	-----	-----
17	---	-----	-----	-----
18	---	-----	-----	-----
19	---	-----	-----	-----

\_\_\_\_\_

Signature of Deponent

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN BEFORE ME

THIS \_\_\_\_ DAY OF \_\_\_\_\_, 2019.

\_\_\_\_\_

(Notary Public) MY COMMISSION EXPIRES: \_\_\_\_\_



# Exhibit 4

12/26/2018

Yahoo Mail - ^\_Council^\_district palm card design

## ^\_Council^\_district palm card design

From: Nicholas LaLota (lalota@yahoo.com)

To: chairman@suffolkcountygop.com

Date: Monday, July 2, 2018, 5:07 PM EDT

Side 1:

### Status Quo: "At-Large System"

With the current "At-large" system, Babylon Town currently has four Council Members, who are charged with representing the Town's 130,000 voters.

Question: What's worse than one-party rule?

Answer: One-man rule.

Candidates for Town Council aren't really democratically-elected. Rather, candidates are hand-picked by one man, who concurrently serves as both the Town Supervisor and Party Chairman. Most other Long Island Towns have laws against holding both roles.

Red Tape. When constituents of one hamlet have a problem with taxes, trash pickup, potholes, street lights or a zoning issue, they do not have a single Council Member to hold accountable. Rather, hamlets have to navigate a complex system where their voices are made to compete with voices from more than a dozen other hamlets.

(Map of Town with stars where current council members live)

Side 2:

### Vote Yes to The Ward System!

With the Ward System, aka "Council Districts," The Town of Babylon will have four locally elected Council Members, accountable to smaller districts of about 32,500 voters.

Each Council District will likely be comprised of 2-3 hamlets each, with each Council Member elected from within the community, who best understands their needs.

It's likely that communities like North Amityville and Wyandanch will get its own Council Member, just as Babylon Village and West Babylon will, too. Voters will be able to get attention to their community's needs; whether its public safety or canal dredging. If the Council Member responds well to his/her district's needs, they'll likely earn re-election. If not, the new smaller-sized districts will give voters a real ability to select a new representative.

Of course, existing Council members, can run for Council within their own Council District—so can civic leaders, School Board Members, business owners and community activists!

The Towns of Brookhaven and Hempstead have successfully implemented council districts.



12/26/2018

Yahoo Mail - ^\_Council^\_ district palm card design

(Map of town with possible new districts)

# Exhibit 7



8:22 PM

40%

[All Inboxes \(9064\)](#)


Several groups, including Babylon Republicans, are petitioning to get a ward system referendum on the ballot this November. The initiative, if it passes, will implement a ward system in the Town of Babylon that would replace the four at-large seats on the Town Council with four Councilmanic Districts.

**I cannot overstate how crucial this effort is to bring principled Republican leadership into Babylon Town Hall. Creating town council districts throughout Babylon would put Republicans in a position to hold a majority on the town board for the first time in decades.**

In order to advance this initiative and to ensure it gets on November's ballot, Babylon Republicans need our help between now and [September 9th](#). During the next 9 days, we will not be walking door-to-door, but will be joining with our fellow republicans to collect signatures at shopping centers.

Even if you can only give one night, morning, or afternoon of your time, this is a worthwhile effort. Please contact **Mark Gallo, Babylon GOP Executive Director**, at [\(631\) 505-7759](tel:6315057759). He will be coordinating this effort at Babylon GOP HQ every day.

Thank you for your continued support.

Respectfully,

**Bill Garbarino**

Chairman William Garbarino  
Islip Town Republican Committee



# Exhibit 10



## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
2	JOHN C COCHRANE JR	47 WOODLAND DR BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1918	
	GIORLANDO PUCCIO	106 HIAWATHA DR BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1824	
3	BRIANNE WAKEFIELD	111 PARK AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706	
	THOMAS WAKEFIELD JR	111 PARK AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706	
4	JOHN A MATTIA	14 HOWELLS RD BAY SHORE NY 11706-6518	
	STUART T YOUNG	28 BENJAMIN ST BAY SHORE NY 11706-7208	
7	ELIZABETH ALTREUTER	118 S CLINTON AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-8605	
	NINA L HOLMES	483 PINE ACRES BLVD BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1218	
8	BRETT L ROBERTS	50 ELM WALK FAIR HARBOR NY 11706	PO BOX 266 OCEAN BEACH NY 11770-0266
10	GREGORY P BODKIN	76 MAPLE ST ISLIP NY 11751-4623	
	ROBIN BRADY	42 CONNETQUOT RD BAYPORT NY 11705-2112	
11	KEITH F RUBY	16 PLUM PL ISLIP NY 11751-3715	
12	MICHAEL A BRANDI	102A RAILROAD PLZ BAY SHORE NY 11706-7394	
	MARGARET GARBARINO	54 WIGGINS AVE PATCHOGUE NY 11772-3836	
13	PATRICIA BERGIN-WEICHBRODT	42 THE HELM E ISLIP NY 11730-2916	
	DENNIS MC CARTHY	51 BERGEN LN BLUE POINT NY 11715-2102	
14	SALVATORE MASSA	15 OAK LN BLUE POINT NY 11715-1715	
	JOHN J PERNICIARO	5 WYANDANCH AVE E ISLIP NY 11730-2511	
15	DINA CICALÉ	14 DONNA PL E ISLIP NY 11730-3230	
	TIMOTHY F MORRIS	157 MC CONNELL AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1738	
16	ANNE S BEDARD	380 ST JOHNS ST CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-3024	
	RICHARD D CLARKE IV	400 CLAYTON ST CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-3004	
17	DEBRA A CAVANAGH	21 WALNUT ST CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-4132	
18	KATHERINE GARBARINO	76 COLLINS AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-3102	
	PATRICK F YOUNG	1131 SMITHTOWN AVE BOHEMIA NY 11716-2127	



## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
19	BRYAN A BORTZFIELD	341 MIDDLE RD BAYPORT NY 11705-1901	
	ANDREW R GARBARINO	234 FAIRVIEW AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1844	
20	EDWARD H MC CARTHY	102 MADISON ST BLUE POINT NY 11715-1635	
	JAMES J WEIK JR	278 SAYVILLE BLVD SAYVILLE NY 11782-2012	
21	PETER ROGERS	5 LITTLEWOOD LN BAYPORT NY 11705-1870	
	RICHARD J ZAPOLSKI JR	15 SUYDAM LN BAYPORT NY 11705-2106	
22	ANNE M DANZIGER	8 WESTMINSTER DR BOHEMIA NY 11716-3969	
23	FRANCES V BRECHTER	124 CAMBRIDGE AVE HOLBROOK NY 11741-3106	
	PAUL J FUSCO	144 MAYSTRIK AVE HOLBROOK NY 11741-3150	
24	DONALD A RETTALIATA JR	148 S FAIRVIEW AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-2210	
25	NEIL A ROSENBERG	2188 PINE AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6529	
26	JOHN C COCHRANE	80 CONCOURSE E BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1511	
	TRACEY E KRUT-LANGE	83 S WINDSOR AVE BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1516	
28	PHILIP M BOYLE	73 S PENATAQUIT AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-8816	
31	CARA K GANDOLFO	655 MYRTLE AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-3717	
	JARETT C GANDOLFO	655 MYRTLE AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-3717	
34	CHRISTOPHER A CACOPERDO	83 CLEVELAND ST BAY SHORE NY 11706-5815	
	JUDITH E LAMBIASE	1341 CHICAGO AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-4602	
35	CHRISTOPHER M DE LUCA	30 WALL ST E ISLIP NY 11730-1717	
37	THOMAS D LUCIANO	9 RIVERA LN W SAYVILLE NY 11796-1513	
	ELIZABETH ROGERS	5 LITTLEWOOD LN BAYPORT NY 11705-1870	
38	SUSAN L KUBELLE	64 PINE ST SAYVILLE NY 11782-3208	
	VINCENT F LIGUORI III	39 RIVER ST SAYVILLE NY 11782-3209	
39	ANTOON T BRINKMANN	83 SEAMAN AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-2015	
	PATRICIA M BRINKMANN	83 SEAMAN AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-2015	



## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
40	ANNA CILMI	14 BOYD AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-8908	
	THOMAS CILMI	14 BOYD AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-8908	
41	NOEL P NIXON	469 ACKERSON BLVD BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1718	
42	RICHARD C KLEIN	176 SHADYBROOK LN W ISLIP NY 11795-4602	
43	PATRICK O'FARRELL	1850 N MONROE AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1921	
	ANTHONY L RIOS	722 PINE AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-2706	
44	PATRICK S FREGA	1085 NUGENT AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-1305	
	ANN MARIE VALLONE	1085 NUGENT AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-1305	
45	MARK MASSA	151 LOWELL RD SAYVILLE NY 11782-2214	
	BRIAN MORRIS	102 GREELEY AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-2632	
47	JAMES H BOWERS	2 LARKSPUR DR W ISLIP NY 11795-3915	
49	JANE A CONKLING	381 GREAT RIVER RD GREAT RIVER NY 11739	PO BOX 22 GREAT RIVER NY 117390022
	HAROLD E SUNDIN	115 ELDER RD ISLIP NY 11751-4910	
52	ERIC M HOFMEISTER	447 GREENE AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-3032	
	WILLIAM G MANNIX	16 HIGH ST SAYVILLE NY 11782-1110	
53	CAROL L CHARCHALIS	30 FAIRVIEW AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1806	
	PATRICIA LOZIER	11 KENT CT BAYPORT NY 11705-1872	
54	KEVIN M NITZSCHE	337 THRIFT ST RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6232	
56	MICHAEL A MERCURIO	27 PIPER CT W ISLIP NY 11795-5027	
57	JOHN DI CIOCCIO	857 HAMPSHIRE RD BAY SHORE NY 11706-7632	
	RICHARD M PETERSON	699 PEASE LN W ISLIP NY 11795-3422	
58	DOMINICK LETTIERI	16 KENT CT W ISLIP NY 11795-2812	
	JOHN N LUQUER III	62 SUTTON CT W ISLIP NY 11795-3016	
61	JOSEPH J MANDANICI	1 KATHERINE PL OAKDALE NY 11769-1703	
	LYNN ROGERS	5 LITTLEWOOD LN BAYPORT NY 11705-1870	

## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

<b>ED#</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Address</b>	<b>Mailing Address</b>
62	THOMAS J PALAZZO	752 SANDRA AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-2526	
66	JOHN P FINNERTY JR	3 LONGDRIVE CT BAY SHORE NY 11706-7723	
69	STEVEN COPPOLA	1509 WASHINGTON AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1629	
	MARY FRIEDLAND	1315 PINE AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1821	
70	MARIA A BARBARA	19 ROCKET DR ISLIP TERR NY 11752-2911	
	WILLIAM F GORMLEY JR	75 WOODHOLLOW RD GREAT RIVER NY 11739	PO BOX 484 GREAT RIVER NY 11739-0484
74	DORIS KENNEDY	18 GREEN AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-8932	
75	MARILYN CORALES GOGLAS	39 OAK ST CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-4149	
76	STEPHEN E RACH	132 LORRAINE CIR W SAYVILLE NY 11796-1213	
	MICHAEL R TEANEY	980 MONTAUK HWY OAKDALE NY 11769-1432	
77	THOMAS A BETCHER	208 DOVECOTE LN CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-2410	
78	DANIEL J GARBARINO	3 ACADEMY LN OAKDALE NY 11769	
	KEVIN ROGERS	8 LITTLEWOOD LN BAYPORT NY 11705-1869	
79	EDWARD MC GARR II	505 SYCAMORE AVE OAKDALE NY 11769-1511	
	JAMES SCHMIDT	75 OCEAN AVE BLUE POINT NY 11715-2109	
80	BARBARA L EHLICH	1168 BROOKDALE AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-1831	
81	ROBERT ROGERS	8 LITTLEWOOD LN BAYPORT NY 11705-1869	
	ANDREW T WITTMAN III	308 LINCOLN AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-1402	
87	NICHOLAS G ANDRONICA	10 DONNA PL E ISLIP NY 11730-3230	
	PATRICIA M ANDRONICA	10 DONNA PL E ISLIP NY 11730-3230	
88	LAWRENCE P FARRELL	332 COLLINGTON DR RONKONKOMA NY 11779-4915	
	THEODORE J GUTIERREZ	385 BOULDER ST RONKONKOMA NY 11779-4908	
89	PAUL KRAUSE	5 SALTMEADOW CT BAYPORT NY 11705-2205	
	DENNIS MAUD	19 SMITH ST BLUE POINT NY 11715-1703	



## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
90	DEBORAH COPPOLA	1509 WASHINGTON AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1629	
	NATALIA COPPOLA	1509 WASHINGTON AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1629	
91	JAMES P O'CONNOR	84 WIDGEON CT GREAT RIVER NY 11739	PO BOX 363 GREAT RIVER NY 11739-0363
95	THOMAS F O'HARA	7 ALDEN RD BRENTWOOD NY 11717-2131	
99	WILLIAM R GARBARINO	76 COLLINS AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-3102	
	PAUL J LA FOUNTAIN	270 BAYPORT AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1853	
101	JOHN W BUGLER	20 MINA RD OAKDALE NY 11769-1827	
	DARLEEN A CAMMARATA	14 RIVERA LN W SAYVILLE NY 11796-1514	PO BOX 153 WEST SAYVILLE NY 117960153
102	MATTHEW BRADY	42 CONNETQUOT RD BAYPORT NY 11705-2112	
105	FEDELE T BAUCCIO	20 ALAN ST E ISLIP NY 11730-2822	
	JANET MASSA	15 OAK LN BLUE POINT NY 11715-1715	
106	RYAN T KELLY	39 SUNSET DR SAYVILLE NY 11782-2808	
	ROBERT M MARO	218 LAKELAND AVE # K4 SAYVILLE NY 11782-1925	
108	LINDA L MISTLER	8 BELINDA CT SAYVILLE NY 11782-2240	
	RICHARD J SCHWAMB	759 ROGERS RD BOHEMIA NY 11716-3503	
109	STEVEN D GELLAR	127 BABYLON AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1231	
114	MICHAEL J LA VECCHIA SR	22 LURCOTT LN CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-2415	
	KELLY M SCHAEFFER	52 MILLER AVE CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-1502	PO BOX 794 YAPHANK NY 119800794
117	MICHAEL J TOMOSSONE	597 GRAND BLVD BRENTWOOD NY 11717-7901	51 RICHARD BLVD ISLIP TERRACE NY 11752
118	MARY C GRAF	214 CLARINET LN HOLBROOK NY 11741-4604	
	CHARLES M TRUPIA	58 HAVEN AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-5922	
120	DAWN MARIE D KUHN	931 NEMETH ST BOHEMIA NY 11716-2120	
	MICHAEL S SINISKI	19 ZAVRA ST BOHEMIA NY 11716-1713	
121	NANCY DONOHUE	179 ANCHORAGE DR W ISLIP NY 11795-5006	
122	THOMAS J COFFEY	917 OCEAN AVE BOHEMIA NY 11716-3628	

## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
123	ARNOLD M BEIN	882 UNION BLVD W ISLIP NY 11795-3723	
	MARLENE L JOHNSTON	51 BARDOLIER LN W BAY SHORE NY 11706-7522	
126	JEAN M GRAF	215 CLARINET LN HOLBROOK NY 11741-4603	
	CHARLES T VERMILYEA	16 ANNANDALE RD HOLBROOK NY 11741-5002	
127	STEVEN J FLOTTERON	280 WOODLAND DR BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1921	
	RONALD THOMPSON	133 WILHERM LN W ISLIP NY 11795-3830	
129	KENNETH C GESSECK	136 CHURCH AVE ISLIP NY 11751-4302	
130	KELLY J MURRAY	56 JONES DR SAYVILLE NY 11782-2805	
	KATHLEEN M RACH	132 LORRAINE CIR W SAYVILLE NY 11796-1213	
131	ADAM E PAPADOULIAS	27 CANNON DR HOLBROOK NY 11741-5216	
	JOSEPH M VENTRICE	199 NINA ST HOLBROOK NY 11741-4609	
132	DONALD A RETTALIATA	8 DEMARRE LN BAYPORT NY 11705-2010	
	SHEILA C RETTALIATA	8 DEMARRE LN BAYPORT NY 11705-2010	
134	RICHARD HOFFMANN	143 WEDGEWOOD DR HAUPPAUGE NY 11788-3417	
136	THOMAS B HEMINGWAY	475 RICHLAND BLVD BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1221	
	JOAN MC CARTHY	51 BERGEN LN BLUE POINT NY 11715-2102	
137	DENNIS A BOYLE	3 FERN PL OAKDALE NY 11769-2007	
	ROBERT J SCHAEFER	31 MIDDLESEX AVE OAKDALE NY 11769-1917	
139	JEANNE CAMPO	432 ALPHABET ST HOLBROOK NY 11741-5702	
	CAITLIN E GRAF	214 CLARINET LN HOLBROOK NY 11741-4604	
140	BRENDAN R CHAMBERLAIN	469 GREENBELT PKY HOLTSVILLE NY 11742-2228	
141	STEVE DOLER	23 PAULANNA AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-2127	
	BRUCE P VETRI	559 LAKEVIEW AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1205	
142	BETH A O'BRIEN	670 3RD ST RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6329	
	DANIEL R O'BRIEN	670 3RD ST RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6329	



## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
143	BRIAN D GUINTA	50 CEDAR AVE ISLIP NY 11751-3802	
	PETER TAFE	11 OAKWOOD ST BLUE POINT NY 11715-1115	
144	BARBARA A REUSCHLE	47 MACON AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-2409	
	JOHN D REUSCHLE	47 MACON AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-2409	
145	C C CURRAN JR	155 BAY AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-2004	
	PAMELA J GREENE	110 CONNETQUOT RD BAYPORT NY 11705-2112	
147	ANGIE M CARPENTER	776 PEASE LN W ISLIP NY 11795-3427	
	FRANCIS J FRANZONE	1553 N MONROE AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1918	
148	GLEN CARBALLO	73 40TH ST ISLIP NY 11751-1124	
	KIMBERLY A SCALICE	119 46TH ST ISLIP NY 11751-1705	
149	EDMOND B MC DONALD	328 2ND AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1310	
151	ROSEMARY E CLAUS	SPRINGMEADOWS AT HAUPPAUGE 656 VILLAGE DR HAUPPAUGE NY 11788-3216	
152	ANDREW J SCARDINO	2328 MOTOR PKY RONKONKOMA NY 11779-4852	
153	JOHN J FERRARA	122 CALVERT AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-5920	
	JUDY A FERRARA	122 CALVERT AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-5920	
154	WILLIAM H MEYER	1942 LOUIS KOSSUTH AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6423	
	KEVIN S ROSENBERG	2188 PINE AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6529	
155	JOHN J COUGHLIN JR	295 RAILROAD AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-2709	PO BOX 452 SAYVILLE NY 11782-0452
	JOHN M VERDONE	20 EASTOVER RD SAYVILLE NY 11782-1113	
157	JONATHON DASARO	431 CHINA RD SAYVILLE NY 11782-1412	PO BOX 784 SAYVILLE NY 11782-0784
	MATTHEW PARROTT	97 BAYVIEW AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-2109	
159	EDWARD COFFEY	814 KARSHICK ST BOHEMIA NY 11716-3602	
	JUSTIN A SCHWAMB	759 ROGERS RD BOHEMIA NY 11716-3503	

## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
161	MICHAEL J SACCA	165 LOOP DR SAYVILLE NY 11782-1525	
	ALEXIS WEIK	278 SAYVILLE BLVD SAYVILLE NY 11782-2012	
162	RONALD BONANNO	218 CLARINET LN HOLBROOK NY 11741-4604	
163	GUY W GERMANO	38 AWIXA AVE BAY SHORE NY 11706-8802	
	JOSEPH A MC NULTY	425 PINE ACRES BLVD BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1217	
164	GREGORY S HANCOCK	17 WILLIAM AVE E ISLIP NY 11730-2304	
	RICHARD A SCHWAMB	759 ROGERS RD BOHEMIA NY 11716-3503	
165	ROBERT J IRWIN	112 LOCUST AVE OAKDALE NY 11769-1614	
	NANCY OAKLEY	468 LINCOLN AVE SAYVILLE NY 11782-1406	
166	CLAUDIA TANTONE	267 MC CONNELL AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1740	
	KENNETH C WEEKS	532 RENEE DR BAYPORT NY 11705-1239	
169	GERARD K FULLER	73 GREENWOOD RD BAY SHORE NY 11706-5024	
	VALERIE L NOGUERAS	73 GREENWOOD RD BAY SHORE NY 11706-5024	
171	STEVEN L BRUNO	78 BRENTWOOD ST BAY SHORE NY 11706-1921	
172	BRYAN T IANNE	227 SPRINGMEADOW DR # H HOLBROOK NY 11741-4132	
	PETER P PEKRUL	4 VAL CT HOLBROOK NY 11741-5508	
173	CHARLES GRAF	214 CLARINET LN HOLBROOK NY 11741-4604	
	ROBERT A HOGAN	16 SANTA ANITA CT HOLBROOK NY 11741-4304	PO BOX 1146 HOLBROOK NY 117411146
176	GENEVIEVE N GOGLAS	39 OAK ST CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-4149	
177	JOSEPH A STASSI	123 OLD POST DR HAUPPAUGE NY 11788-3443	
	THERESA STASSI	123 OLD POST DR HAUPPAUGE NY 11788-3443	
179	CHRISTOPHER J GIAMBRONE	15 MARIA CT HOLBROOK NY 11741-3501	
	VINCENT J MESSINA JR	275 CLARINET LN HOLBROOK NY 11741-3832	
180	GERARD J HULSEN	148 AVE D HOLBROOK NY 11741-2337	
	KATHRYN O'ROURKE	12 HORSESHOE DR HOLBROOK NY 11741-1922	



## SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party****County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested****Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

ED#	Name	Address	Mailing Address
182	STEVEN P HYLAND	15 BAY 1ST ST ISLIP NY 11751-4403	
184	MICHAEL J CAHILL	325 WOODLAND DR BRIGHTWATERS NY 11718-1924	
	JOSEPH V SCHETTINO	927 GARDINER DR BAY SHORE NY 11706-7602	
192	MELINDA A KERRIGAN	48 ARLINE LN E ISLIP NY 11730-3613	
	CATHERINE RIEDEL	26 JEFFERSON ST E ISLIP NY 11730-1835	
193	ANGEL M RIVERA	133 GREENWOOD RD BAY SHORE NY 11706-5022	
195	THOMAS R PARSON	55 ACE CT W ISLIP NY 11795-2001	
197	JONATHAN R BLOOM	77 WOODHOLLOW RD GREAT RIVER NY 11739	PO BOX 76 GREAT RIVER NY 11739-0076
	KEVIN J SHIRES	387 GREAT RIVER RD GREAT RIVER NY 11739	PO BOX 341 GREAT RIVER NY 117390341
201	RONALD F DEVINE JR	408 BAYPORT AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1404	
202	MICHAEL STACK	2284 5TH AVE RONKONKOMA NY 11779-6207	
203	MURIEL A DRISCOLL	52 MUNSON LN W SAYVILLE NY 11796-1522	
	ROLAND F DRISCOLL	52 MUNSON LN W SAYVILLE NY 11796-1522	
208	ARTHUR L LAUFER JR	757 PEASE LN W ISLIP NY 11795-3426	
	JOHN A STANTON JR	65 OAK NECK LN W ISLIP NY 11795-5117	
210	ERIC S BUEHLER	31 CORNELL ST ISLIP NY 11751-2129	
	KEVIN T GLOCK	277 BROOKVILLE AVE ISLIP NY 11751-1110	
212	NICOLE J GRAZIANO	519 CADMAN RD W ISLIP NY 11795-1301	
	VINCENT M SEPE	107 DONCASTER AVE W ISLIP NY 11795-1234	
213	RYAN MASSA	15 OAK LN BLUE POINT NY 11715-1715	
	ANTHONY A PICCIRILLO	80 MIDDLETON RD # 1 BOHEMIA NY 11716-3925	
214	GEORGE ROGERS	20 GILLETTE AVE BAYPORT NY 11705-1843	
	JANESSA M TROTTO	1620 LOUIS KOSSUTH AVE BOHEMIA NY 11716-1512	
216	JOSEPH V TREPICCIONE	127 CASSA LOOP HOLTSVILLE NY 11742	
	MARILYN WENZ	23 SCOPELITIS CT HOLBROOK NY 11741	

SUFFOLK COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

**Republican Party**

**County Committee Contest Results - Winners in Primary, Uncontested**

**Islip**

Feb 14, 2019

<b>ED#</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Address</b>	<b>Mailing Address</b>
217	DOUGLAS E KING	1216 KIRKLAND CT CENTRAL ISLIP NY 11722-4480	
221	JOHN J MAREK	2131 MOTOR PKY HAUPPAUGE NY 11788-5209	
223	DOUGLAS M SMITH	275 S ROBERTS ST HOLBROOK NY 11741-3844	
	ELIZABETH R SMITH	275 S ROBERTS ST HOLBROOK NY 11741-3844	



# Exhibit 18

12/26/2018

Yahoo Mail - Fwd: Babylon ^\_Council^\_ ^\_Districts^\_

Fwd: Babylon ^\_Council^\_ ^\_Districts^\_

From: Nicholas LaLota (lalota@yahoo.com)

To: callspi@optonline.net; chairman@suffolkcountygop.com

Date: Saturday, August 18, 2018, 10:01 AM EDT

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** [angiecarp930@aol.com](mailto:angiecarp930@aol.com)

**Date:** August 18, 2018 at 09:52:25 EDT

**To:** [info@suffolkcountygop.com](mailto:info@suffolkcountygop.com)

**Cc:** John jay LaValle <[Chairman@suffolkcountygop.com](mailto:Chairman@suffolkcountygop.com)>, William Garbarino <[williamRgarbarino@hotmail.com](mailto:williamRgarbarino@hotmail.com)>

**Subject:** Re: Babylon Council Districts

Tony,

You know I am always there for you and the Babylon GOP, but this puts me in a very difficult position. This is a very sensitive issue and we are smack in the middle of a very expensive lawsuit and it Islip residents are involved, it could really hurt us. I'm sure you will understand.

Warmest regards, Angie

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 17, 2018, at 5:33 PM, Vice Chairman Anthony Pancella, III <[info@suffolkcountygop.com](mailto:info@suffolkcountygop.com)> wrote:



IMPORTANT NEWS FROM THE SUFFOLK GOP

Angie,



12/26/2018

Yahoo Mail - Fwd: Babylon ^\_Council^\_ ^\_Districts^\_

As the Babylon Town Republican Chairman and Vice Chairman of our County's Republican Committee, I am writing to invite you to a petition drive for Council Districts in the Town of Babylon this Saturday, August 18th at 10am at:

Athenian Garden Apartments  
49 Athens Court West Babylon, NY 11704

We need your help to get the 2,000+ signatures required to ensure the Babylon Council District referendum is on this November's ballot.

Council Districts will help bring more effective and representative government to the Babylon taxpayers.

Council Districts will also bring a more fiscally responsible and bi-partisan approach to a Town Board that hasn't had a Republican elected to it since Councilwoman Fran Brown won election in 1999.

As historian Lord Acton, concluded, "Power tends to corrupt, and absolute power corrupts absolutely."

I hope to see you on Saturday. Please reply if you're coming so we can make proper arrangements. The more, the merrier!

Sincerely,

**Tony**

Anthony Pancella, III  
Vice Chairman, Suffolk County Republican Committee

Suffolk County Republican Committee  
1150 Portion Road, Suite 2, Holtsville, NY 11742

See what's happening on our social sites



12/26/2018

Yahoo Mail - Fwd: Babylon ^\_Council^ ^\_Districts^\_

Suffolk County Republican Committee, 1150 Portion Rd, Suite 2, Holtsville, NY 11742

[SafeUnsubscribe™ angiecarp930@aol.com](#)

[Forward this email](#) | [Update Profile](#) | [About our service provider](#)

Sent by [info@suffolkcountygop.com](mailto:info@suffolkcountygop.com) in collaboration with

**Constant Contact** 

Try it free today